UNIT 3 · LESSON 9 ANSWER KEY

From evidence to claim

How do I turn evidence into a paragraph?

AIMS

How confident are you now? Circle one face for each aim at the end of the lesson.

Content Turn evidence from one Titanic source into a clear, careful paragraph. ☹ 😐 🙂

Language Link a claim, evidence and inference with reference words: It shows that… / This evidence suggests… / This means… ☹ 😐 🙂

Skills Choose relevant evidence and explain what it suggests. ☹ 😐 🙂

Rate: Where have we practised this?

In Lesson 11 your teacher will check these five things. Look at the lessons where we practised each one. Then circle 1, 2 or 3.

	I can…	We practised this in…	Me now
1	**I can understand the sources.** say what they say or show	**L1 Zheng He** **L3 Terracotta Army** **L5 Black Ships**	1 2 3
2	**I can use evidence to support my ideas.** choose useful details and explain them	**L2 Pompeii** **L6 Sutton Hoo** **L8 Titanic**	1 2 3
3	**I can explain inferences carefully.** it shows… it suggests… do not say too much	**L2 Pompeii** **L6 Sutton Hoo**	1 2 3
4	**I can compare the sources.** supports, partly supports, challenges	**L4 Hamel** **L7 Angkor** **L8 Titanic**	1 2 3
5	**I can make a supported judgement.** answer “How far…?” or “To what extent…?” overall	**L5 Black Ships** **L8 Titanic**	1 2 3

1 = not yet 2 = getting there 3 = confident

Today: rows 2 and 3.

Read: Is it relevant?

Read Source F. Does it help to answer the question about the view?

The view: Titanic sank mainly because it was travelling too fast for the icy conditions.



Modern illustration.

Source F: the lifeboats

The British inquiry report (July 1912) also wrote about Titanic's lifeboats.

"The Titanic was provided with 20 boats." [Titanic had 20 lifeboats.]

"The total boat accommodation was 1,178 persons." [There was room for 1,178 people in the lifeboats.]

There were about 2,200 people on board.

The boats "left behind them many hundreds of lives to perish" [many hundreds of people were left on the ship and died].

Adapted from: British Wreck Commissioner's Inquiry, Report on the Loss of the "Titanic", 30 July 1912 ("Account of the Saving and Rescue of Those Who Survived: Boats").

Suggested answer: **Source F is not relevant to the question, because it is about the lifeboats (why so many people died), not the speed (why the ship sank).**

Quote it: Use the source's exact words

Finish each sentence with exact words from Source F. Use quotation marks " ".

Suggested answer: **a) The report says that the boats "left behind them many hundreds of lives to perish".**

Suggested answer: **b) There were not enough lifeboats. The report says that Titanic "was provided with 20 boats". There were about 2,200 people on board, but "the total boat accommodation was 1,178 persons".**

Take apart: A strong paragraph

A student wrote about Source E. Read the source, then the paragraph.



Modern illustration.

Source E: the other ship

The Californian stopped because there was so much ice. Less than an hour before the crash, it sent Titanic a radio message: “Say, old man, we are stopped and surrounded by ice.”

Titanic’s radio room answered: “Shut up, shut up, I am busy.”

(1) Source E partly supports the view. **(2)** It shows that another ship, the Californian, was “stopped and surrounded by ice” less than an hour before Titanic hit the iceberg. **(3)** This evidence suggests that there was a lot of dangerous ice near Titanic, because a ship nearby had to stop. This means that it was probably safer for Titanic to slow down. **(4)** However, the evidence does not prove that Titanic was going too fast, because Source E does not tell us Titanic’s speed.

1 Find the quote. Which exact words from Source E are inside the quotation marks “ ”? Copy them.

Suggested answer: **“stopped and surrounded by ice”**

2 What reason does the writer give for the inference? Look after *because*.

Suggested answer: **A ship nearby had to stop (so there was a lot of dangerous ice).**

3 Underline the linking words: *It · This evidence · This means · because · However*

Teacher: Linking words: It = Source E; This evidence = the ship stopped in the ice; This means = one more step (so Titanic should slow down). Chain: more ice → more danger → slow down? Source E shows the first two steps; it does not tell us Titanic’s speed, so it only partly supports the view.

4 Why does Source E only *partly* support the view?

Suggested answer: **Because Source E does not tell us Titanic’s speed. It shows the ice was dangerous, but not that Titanic was going too fast.**

Fix: A weak paragraph

Another student wrote about Source B. Find three problems.



Titanic's surviving officers, about May 1912. Public domain.

Source B: the Second Officer

A lawyer asked Lightoller, Titanic's Second Officer: was it "recklessness" to travel at 21½ knots near ice?

He answered: "It is ordinary navigation." [the normal way to sail a ship]

"Recklessness applies to practically every commander and every ship crossing the Atlantic Ocean."

(1) Source B proves that Titanic sank because it was going too fast. **(2)** Lightoller was the Second Officer and he survived. **(3)** He said, "It is ordinary navigation." **(4)** There were not enough lifeboats, so many people died.

Problem	Sentence(s)	How to fix it
Too strong	**1**	**Use supports / partly supports / challenges. Never proves.**
Not relevant	**2 and 4**	**Cut it. Use evidence about the speed and the ice.**
No explanation	**3**	**Add This suggests that… because…**

Fix it together Rewrite the paragraph with your teacher.

Claim Source B …
Evidence It shows that …
Inference This suggests that … because …
Be careful However, the evidence does not prove …

Suggested answer: **Source B challenges the view. It shows that Lightoller called the speed "ordinary navigation". This suggests that Titanic was not going faster than other ships, because he says "recklessness applies to practically every commander and every ship". However, the evidence does not prove that the speed was safe, because Lightoller was one of Titanic's officers, so he may want to defend the crew.**

Write: Your own paragraph

Read Source G. Tell your partner: “It shows that… This suggests that…” Then write your paragraph (50–80 words).



J. Bruce Ismay, 1912. Author unknown. Public domain.

Source G: the company boss

Bruce Ismay was the head of the White Star Line, the company that owned Titanic. He was on the ship and survived. The US Senate inquiry asked him questions on 19 April 1912.

“I understand it has been stated that the ship was going at full speed. The ship never had been at full speed.”

“She had not all her boilers on.” [boilers = big tanks that make steam for the engines]

“It was our intention, if we had fine weather on Monday afternoon or Tuesday, to drive the ship at full speed.” [intention = plan]

Adapted from: J. Bruce Ismay, evidence to the United States Senate Inquiry, Day 1, 19 April 1912.

Claim Source G supports / partly supports / challenges the view.
Evidence It shows that …
Inference This suggests that … because …
Be careful However, the evidence does not prove … / Ismay may …
Link it This corroborates / contradicts Source ___, which says …

Suggested answer: **Source G challenges the view. It shows that Ismay said “the ship never had been at full speed”. This suggests that Titanic was not going as fast as possible, because “she had not all her boilers on”. However, the evidence does not prove that the speed was safe for the ice, because a ship can be too fast for ice without going at full speed. Also, Ismay was the head of the company, so he may want to defend it. This contradicts Source A, which says the speed was “excessive”. (Or: This corroborates Source B, which says the speed was “ordinary navigation”.) (Partly supports is also fine with a reason: the company planned to go even faster.)**

CHECK

- ☐ **Relevant evidence?** I chose words from the source that help answer the question.
- ☐ **Inference explained?** I wrote *This suggests that… because…*
- ☐ **Careful?** I said what the evidence does not prove. No *proves*!
- ☐ **Look back:** look at rows 2 and 3 on page 1. Would you change your number?